Welcome to the 2018 Annual Conference Educational Sessions

Session: Legal Aspects of Code Enforcement & Administration
LEGAL ASPECTS OF
CODE ENFORCEMENT
AND ADMINISTRATION

JUDITH ROTHSCILD DICINE, J.D.
STATE OF CONNECTICUT, DIVISION OF CRIMINAL JUSTICE

INTERNATIONAL CODE COUNCIL
2018 ANNUAL CONFERENCE EDUCATION PROGRAM
RICHMOND, VIRGINIA
OCTOBER 23, 2018
LEGAL DISCLAIMER

This presentation includes important general principles of law regarding building and safety code administration and enforcement. It is not intended to be legal advice to any person. Questions on the proper administration and enforcement of code in your jurisdiction should be directed to the appropriate legal counsel for your jurisdiction.
PERFORMANCE OBJECTIVES

1. Understand that the duly empowered code official in the United States is a "governmental official" and, similarly to police, is bound to administer and enforce code in accordance with the U.S. Constitution and the applicable state constitution, including on matters of right of entry.

2. Know and understand the law generally concerning the authority and obligations of a code official to obtain code compliance through administration and enforcement.

3. Recognize the orders available for building officials under the International Building Code and review when and how each are used in enforcement.

4. Explain general procedure for referring a case to civil and criminal court and what occurs during criminal prosecution.
HOW ARE WE GOING TO MEET THE OBJECTIVES?

BY WHAT WE ARE GOING TO COVER:

– GOALS
– AUTHORITY
– RIGHT OF ENTRY/DENIAL OF ENTRY
– INSPECTION
– ABATEMENT PROCEDURE
– CIVIL AND CRIMINAL COURT
GOALS OF ENFORCEMENT

1. **COMPLIANCE**
   Create safer and healthier communities by enforcement of required code standards. Using the abatement process improves community well being.

2. **CORRECT HUMAN BEHAVIOR**
   Bring the importance of building and fire safety to landlords, tenants and the surrounding community.
If you start at City Hall and drive 15 minutes east to Gross Pointe, a wealthy suburb of Detroit, you’ll cross a difference of nearly 12 years in life expectancy and 10 percent in teen pregnancy rates. Detroit’s children continue to suffer infant mortality, asthma, and lead exposure at higher rates than their counterparts elsewhere.

Source: Office of the United States Assistant Secretary of Health with support from Healthy People 2020
Remediating Abandoned, Inner City Buildings Reduces Crime and Violence in Surrounding Areas

http://www.safeguardproperties.com/News/Industry_Updates/2015/07/Remediating_Abandoned_Inner_City_Buildings_Reduces_Crime_and_Violence_in_Surrounding_Areas.aspx
Case Study: Fatal Fire Waterbury, CT (2011):

32 year old male tenant succumbed to smoke inhalation when the single exit from his 3rd floor attic apartment was blocked by fire.

A joint investigation by state and local officials determined that the building owner converted his 2-family into a 4 without city inspections or approvals. The proximate cause of the tenant’s death was found to be a lack of the code required secondary means of egress in the illegal attic apartment.

Charges against the owner were filed by the Connecticut Office of the Chief State’s Attorney.
Landlord Pleads Guilty To Manslaughter 2nd Degree For Tenant’s Death In Illegal Apartment
At a press conference held on October 19, 2012, Waterbury, CT Mayor O'Leary told the gathering that the city was sending out a loud message that it would not tolerate illegal housing.

Courtesy of Waterbury Observer. Photographs By John Murray
ON TO YOU: THE CODE OFFICIAL
KNOW YOUR AUTHORITY

• Your authority to enforce code comes from several sources, which apply as dictated.
  – U.S. Constitution
  – U.S. Supreme Court and District Court Opinions
  – Federal laws and regulations
  – State Constitution
  – State Court Opinions
  – State laws and regulations
  – Directives from state agencies
  – Local jurisdiction laws and regulations
MINISTERIAL VS. DISCRETIONARY ACTS

- **MINISTERIAL**: When a law, policy or directive clearly establishes that an act must be performed, the relevant officials are not free to exercise their own judgment in determining whether to act.

- **DISCRETIONARY**: Some acts or omissions (the decision of what to do or whether to do anything at all) require professional judgment. Obvious example: “may” vs. “shall.”

CHECK YOUR JURISDICTION ON WHAT HAS BEEN DEEMED A MINISTERIAL VS. A DISCRETIONARY ACT TO AVOID LIABILITY FOR FAILURE TO ACT!!!
PRACTICE PROFESSIONALISM

• Treat people in your community, your office, and in other departments with respect
• Do you best to keep commitments
• Know your code well
• Be honest in all matters
• Don’t take things personally
• Be diligent and effective in gaining compliance, remembering *honey* usually works best
COMMUNICATION = THE KEY TO SUCCESSFUL ENFORCEMENT

“The single biggest problem in communication is the illusion that it has taken place.”

George Bernard Shaw

HOT TIP:
Avoid misunderstandings and delays in correction of violations by requiring that the responsible person provide a reasonable written plan of compliance with dates to start and finish each item.
INSPECTIONS

Many inspection provisions are ministerial in nature, as indicated with words like the official *shall* or *must* inspect. These commands must be followed to avoid potential liability.

However, the code official must always use lawful means to gain entry into private property to inspect, including by consent or a court order.

In an emergency the code official may access as necessary to protect the public safety.
INSPECTIONS

• Entry and inspection must be completed in accordance with law by a duly authorized code official.

• Your notes should indicate date, time and who was present when the inspection was completed.

• Your notes should be specific regarding the type of violations, where the violation occurs and include any special conditions that are present.
PHOTOS

• Photos, videos and sketches are generally allowed if you are legally there to inspect.

• Remember to take notes for the photos: who took the photos, what they depict and the address that you are taking the photos of along with the date/time of the picture.
THE UNITED STATES CONSTITUTION
The right of the people to be secure in their persons, houses, papers, and effects against unreasonable searches and seizures, shall not be violated and no warrants shall issue, but upon probable cause, supported by oath or affirmation, and particularly describing the place to be searched, and the persons or things to be seized.
It’s Not Just For This...
For Federal Constitutional Purposes...

There is No Difference!!!
WHAT IS AN “UNREASONABLE SEARCH”?
Warrantless Searches Are Presumed Unreasonable

(Unless An Exception Applies)
WHY DO YOU CARE?

Illegal entry onto private property *may* result in:

• Exclusion in court of any evidence obtained from an illegal search – *the Exclusionary Rule*
• Municipal and department civil liability
• Personal civil liability
• Personal criminal liability (for intentional acts)
• Administrative sanctions
So How Do We Do It Right?
Know The Warrant Requirement And Its Important Exceptions For The Code Official:

- Consent
- Plain View
- Exigency/Emergency
- Special Need Searches: Regulatory Scheme - Permits
CONSENT
- Consent must be given freely and voluntarily
- Consent must be by an authorized person of suitable age and discretion
- Consent may not be by duress or coercion
- Burden of proof is on the official, so your actions must be proper to prevail on claim of good consent.
CONSENT

- An inference that refusal is futile, or that a search warrant will be issued automatically, has been held to be coercive.
Consent Considerations

- Consent can be withdrawn at any time
- Consent can be limited
Factors Showing Consent

– Knowledge of constitutional rights in general
– Knowledge of the right to refuse consent
– Sufficient age and maturity to make an independent decision
– Intelligence to understand the significance of consent
More Factors Showing Consent

- Education in or experience with the workings of the criminal justice system
- Cooperation with inspectors
- Length of detention and nature of questioning regarding consent
- Coercive governmental behavior surrounding the incident
Third Party Consent...a.k.a. “The Roommate Scenario”

• A person may consent to a search of areas over which he has common authority with another person.
• One person cannot consent to a search of the exclusive possessions or private space of another person.
Third Party Consent

Exception:

• The consent of one occupant is insufficient when another occupant
  – is present, and
  – objects to the search
Third Party Consent: “Apparent Authority”

- Conduct a **reasonable inquiry** of the person giving consent.
Third Party Consent: “Apparent Authority”

• A search without a warrant is valid when it is based on consent given by someone who the government official reasonably believes has common authority over the premises, but who actually does not.
• Based on objectively reasonable belief.
• Each case judged on its own facts.
Third Party Consent

- Not valid from Landlord (even with a right of entry clause in the lease) except in cases of a true emergency.
Third Party Consent

Not valid from a hotel clerk
Written Consent Is Good!

State of Connecticut
DIVISION OF CRIMINAL JUSTICE

Consent To Search And Examine Evidence

Case No: __________ Date: ______ Time: ______ City/Town: __________
Name: ____________________________________________________________
DOB: ____________________________________________________________
Address: __________________________________________________________

I, ____________________________, being of sound mind and not under duress, after having been informed of my Constitutional right not
to have a search performed without a search warrant and of my Constitutional right to refuse to consent to such a search,
DO CONSENT_________ to have: __________ and __________
(Initials) who are members of the Division of Criminal Justice, and __________ and
________________________ who are members of the __________
(insert agency name)
carry out the search and seize any evidence they may believe to exist
conduct a complete search of my:
☐ Residence ☐ Place of business ☐ Vehicle ☐ Other property
(describe vehicle or property to be searched)

which property is located at:

(specify location/address: street, apartment number, room, city or town, state)

I authorize members of the Division of Criminal Justice and the __________________________ Police Department to
take from the location or locations specified above, such materials and other property as they may desire and to perform
examinations and tests, including forensic examinations and tests, on any item seized.

Permission for this search and examination of evidence is granted by me, knowingly, willingly and voluntarily, to the above
named police officer or police officers and no inducements, threats or promises have been made to me in order to gain my
consent.

Signature: ___________________________ Witness:*

Witness: ___________________________ Witness:*

(Except for the entering of the subject’s signature and initials, this form shall be completed by a police inspector/officer; *2 Police inspector/officers
should be witnessed)
Plain View
Plain View

• It is not a search within the Fourth Amendment to observe what is in plain view from a location where you have the right to be.
Plain View

• Requires a “lawful initial entry” =
  – Entry onto private property was lawful, or condition is visible either from a public area or a place you are authorized to be.
  – Must be detectable with one of the five senses, although commonly used enhancement devices may be okay.
To Bar Your Inspection, The Individual Must Have A Reasonable Expectation of Privacy In The Area To Be Searched

- There is **no** reasonable expectation of privacy in **common** hallways of an apartment building
  - Mutual use and control by tenants and owner
  - Used by visitors, delivery people, trades people
  - Can be used by you, too
Reasonable Expectation of Privacy

• No reasonable expectation of privacy of tenant or non-tenant on multi-unit common porch.
Fourth Amendment Doesn’t Protect

- Open Fields

- Abandoned Property
  Buildings which are not occupied and for which a building owner cannot be identified or located by reasonable efforts
“Curtilage,” the area immediately surrounding the house, is considered to be part of the house for Fourth Amendment privacy and warrant requirement purposes.

Generally applies to the exterior of one and two family dwellings, not to three family dwellings or larger (apartment occupancies).
Curtilage or Open Field?

• Factors that help decide:
  – Distance from the house?
  – Fenced in area around the house?
  – Use to which the area is put?
  – Steps taken to protect the area from observation by passers by?
    • 6 foot fence with “keep out”
    • Fence shut: no view from street
Trespass

• An **implicit license** exists for visitors to:
  – Approach by the front path
  – Knock promptly
  – Wait to be received
  – Absent invitation to remain longer, leave

• Government official may do what any other private citizen may do without trespassing
  – Salesman, trick or treater, Girl Scout
Trespass, cont.

• Scope of the implied license is limited to specific purpose.
• No one "is impliedly invited to enter the protected premises of the home in order to do nothing but conduct a search."
No Trespass

OK:

– Walk up the driveway
– Walk up porch steps to front door
– Knock on door
– Observe anything in plain view on your way to and from the door
– Observe anything in plain view from the front porch if resident opens the door
– Ask permission to enter and inspect
Trespass

**NOT OK:**

- Open a gate marked “No trespassing”
- Explore path or yard with specialized devices (metal detector, thermal imager)
- Go into back yard (absent invitation to do so)
- Go around house looking into windows (curtilage)
Exigent Circumstances & Emergency
Exigency/Emergency Circumstances

• *Imminent* and *substantial* threat to life safety or property
• No time to get a warrant
• No other reasonable options
• Mere inconvenience of seeking a warrant is not sufficient
Special Needs Searches:
Regulatory Scheme
SPECIAL NEEDS: Permit Inspection


- Warrantless inspection of private dwelling by municipal administrative officer without consent of owner is generally unreasonable absent specifically delineated circumstances; however, searches pursuant to _regulatory scheme_ need not adhere to usual requirements of warrant and probable cause, where special governmental needs are present.
SPECIAL NEEDS:
Permit Inspection, cont.


**Factors** in applying special needs doctrine, to determine whether special governmental needs outweigh particular privacy interest and thus justify warrantless administrative inspection, are:

• (1) nature of privacy interest allegedly compromised by challenged governmental conduct;

• (2) character of intrusion imposed by challenged conduct; and

• (3) nature and immediacy of state’s concerns and efficacy of governmental conduct in meeting them.
SPECIAL NEEDS:
Permit Inspection, cont.


• In response to wetland permit application, owner had a diminished expectation of privacy.

• Owner chose to apply to construct on state-regulated land, in an area freely visible from navigable water, from public-access beach and from neighbor’s property, and owner was on notice that application process would involve some form of site inspection.
Administrative Search Warrants
WHAT DOES THE U.S. SUPREME COURT SAY ABOUT IT?

• **Camara v. Municipal Court**
  U.S. Supreme Court (1967), 387 U.S. 523 87 S.Ct. 1727, 18 L.Ed.2d 930
  “Probable cause to issue a warrant to inspect for safety code violation exists if reasonable legislative or administrative standards for conducting an area inspection are satisfied.”

• **See v. Seattle**
  U.S. Supreme Court (1967), 387 U.S. 541 87 S.Ct. 1737, 18 L.Ed.2d 943
INSPECTION WHERE ENTRY REFUSED

When cooperation ceases and access to the property is denied, an ADMINISTRATIVE SEARCH WARRANT is required before entry and inspection can be accomplished.
DENIAL OF ENTRY?
CAN’T TAKE “NO” FOR AN ANSWER?

• In most cases you should make a reasonable attempt to gain entry by voluntary consent from the correct person before you seek a warrant.

• Many state and local laws allow a code official entry onto private property. Despite that, some persons refuse that entry. The code official’s right of entry does not mean that the official should get into a physical confrontation at the door. In the event the code official is denied access, an administrative search warrant may be applied for seeking a judge ordered entry.

• Although approved by the U.S. Supreme Court, administrative search warrants must also be permitted by state law. Generally, they also must be approved by a prosecutor before submission to a judge.
ABOUT YOUR FILES:

• General rule: If you write it, be prepared to have it publicized. State laws must be consulted for applicable disclosure laws.

• Freedom of Information laws generally require disclosure of your files, however some items may be closed as confidential.

• Prior to disclosure, seek the opinion of your legal counsel for criminal and civil matters, particularly on an open investigation or pending case.
**ABATEMENT:**

**ISSUING ORDERS:**

- Always identify the owner or other responsible person or entity before issuing legal notice.
- Get a certified copy of the deed for you file as proof ownership. Owners should be listed with full names on the order. Mirroring the deed is good form.
- Please be aware that if the owner is a business, estate, corporation or partnership, additional information may be required. Check with your local attorney on this.

The following slides demonstrate the process of abatement under the 2018 ICC International Building Code®.
• **IBC 114.1** states it shall be unlawful for any person firm or corporation to erect, construct, alter, extend, repair, move, remove, demolish or occupy any building, structure or equipment regulated by this code, or cause same to be done, in conflict with any provisions of this code.
IBC 114.2
NOTICE OF VIOLATION

• Authorizes the *building official* to serve a notice of violation or order on the person responsible for violation of the code, or of a permit or certificate issued under the code.

• Such order *shall* direct the discontinuance of the illegal action or condition and the abatement of the violation.
• If the notice is not complied with promptly, the BO is authorized to request legal counsel of the jurisdiction institute the appropriate proceeding at law as well as in equity to restrain, correct or abate such violation or to require the removal or termination of the unlawful occupancy or of the order or direction made pursuant thereto.
IBC 114.4
VIOLATION PENALTIES

• Any person who violates this code, fails to comply with requirements thereof or of approved construction documents or of the directive of a building official or of a permit or certificate issued shall be subject to penalties as described by law.
IBC 115
STOP WORK ORDER

• IBC 115.1 The BO is authorized to issue a stop work order whenever the BO finds any work regulated this code being performed in a manner either contrary to the provisions of this code or dangerous or unsafe.
IBC 115.2
ISSUANCE OF STOP WORK ORDER

• The order shall be in writing and shall be given to the owner, owner’s agent or the person performing the work.
• The order shall state the reason for the order and the conditions under which the cited work will be permitted to resume.
Any person who shall continue any work after having been served with a stop work order, except as directed to remove or make safe a condition, shall be subject to penalties as prescribed by law.
IBC 116: UNSAFE STRUCTURES AND EQUIPMENT

• IBC 116.1: The BO shall deem structures or equipment an unsafe condition which are or become:
  – Unsafe
  – Insanitary
  – Deficient because of inadequate means of egress, inadequate light and ventilation
IBC 116: UNSAFE STRUCTURES AND EQUIPMENT

— constitute a fire hazard
— Or are otherwise dangerous to human life or public welfare
— Or that involve illegal or improper occupancy or inadequate maintenance.

The BO shall cause a report to be filed on an unsafe condition. SBC 116.2
IBC 116: UNSAFE STRUCTURES AND EQUIPMENT

• Unsafe structures **shall** be taken down and removed or made safe, as the BO deems necessary and as provided in IBC 116.

• A **vacant** structure that is not secured against entry **shall** be deemed unsafe.

**HOT TIP**

Enforcement of this provision can be a tremendous help to community safety.
IBC 116.3
NOTICE OF UNSAFE STRUCTURE

• If an unsafe condition is found, the BO shall serve on the owner, agent or person in control of the structure a written notice that describes the condition and specifies the abatement required, or demolition within a stipulated time.

• Requires the person notified declare immediately to the BO acceptance or rejection of the terms of the order.
• The unsafe structure or equipment order is deemed properly served if delivered to the owner personally, sent certified or registered mail to the last known address return receipt requested, or any other manner prescribed by law.

• If returned undelivered, a copy shall be posted in a conspicuous place in or about the structure.

• Service on the owner’s agent or person responsible for the structure shall constitute service on the owner.
• Although proof of delivery is not specifically required by the IBC, prosecution of a violation generally requires proof that the person actually received the notice.

• Proof of delivery is required to prove knowing violation of the order.
Where the structure or equipment is restored to safe condition, repairs, alterations, additions and change of occupancy shall comply with the requirements of the *International Existing Building Code*. 
EXAMPLE OF ABATEMENT ORDERS:

CONNECTICUT STATE BUILDING CODE (SBC) BUILDING ORDER SET


- 114 Notice of Violation and Order to Abate
- 115 Stop Work Order
- 116 Notice of Unsafe Structure
- 117 Notice of Imminent Harm, Order to Vacate and Posting of Unsafe Structure
- 118 Vacant Structures
- Notice of Referral for Criminal Prosecution

PLUS --- Notice of Referral for Criminal Prosecution
CIVIL AND CRIMINAL COURT

WHAT IS THE DIFFERENCE?
WHAT IS CIVIL ENFORCEMENT?

• INJUNCTIONS
• CIVIL ENFORCEMENT ORDERS
• RELOCATION
• CIVIL PENALTIES
• LIENS
INJUNCTIONS:

• Town Attorney/Corporation Counsel.
• This process will bring the property owners to court, for you and the town to ask the court to order the property owners to abate a violation.
• Be aware the Judge may not rule in your favor.
CRIMINAL PROSECUTION AND ARREST

• Submitting an application for the arrest of an individual is very serious. Make sure this is the appropriate action to take. You are asking for the initiation of a criminal case that may result in the deprivation of the rights of another individual.
CRIMINAL PROSECUTION OF CODE VIOLATIONS

As a Code Official, in most states you do not have power of arrest. However, you may have authority to apply for an arrest warrant for code violations by application to a proper authority. An Arrest Warrant requires application to judge alleging sufficient PROBABLE CAUSE, including:

- Your name, capacity, responsibilities and your jurisdiction.
- Authority to inspect, inspection dates, and findings.
- Identification of the proper person and how that person was determined, i.e. proof of ownership, etc.
- Notice and order issued, to whom and how the orders were issued showing due process.
CRIMINAL PROSECUTION OF CODE VIOLATIONS, CONT.

– Proof that the orders were received by the responsible.
– Re-inspection date and findings.
– List of the violations and the code sections that are violated.
– Summary/Concluding paragraph.
– Must be signed and sworn under penalty of perjury and submitted to the Prosecutor or to Office of the District Attorney as provided by local jurisdiction.

Reminder: These are State of Connecticut provisions... check locally for yours.
WHAT HAPPENS AT COURT?

• Cited person will come to court.
• Remember, just because the cited person comes to court, it does not mean compliance will be immediate.
CRIMINAL PROSECUTION

• FIRST COURT DATE:
  – RIGHT TO COUNSEL
  – REVIEW CHARGES AND PENALITES
  – RIGHT TO DUE PROCESS AND EQUAL PROTECTION
  – RIGHT TO A SPEEDY TRIAL
  – IF THE CITED PERSON COOPERATES, OBTAIN AN AGREEABLE PLAN FOR COMPLIANCE
  – WITH THE COURT’S PERMISSION GIVE A CONTINUANCE DATE FOR THAT COMPLIANCE
PRE-TRIAL STATUS...

- Discovery stage of case, pretrial negotiations to settle
- While the case is pending we will ask for inspections to be completed
- Sometimes, we will ask for written updates so that we have current information in our files
- If ADDITIONAL violations are found on a re-inspection, abate the additional violations and notify the state’s attorney promptly
- Nearly all cases settle in this stage by plea agreement
CRIMINAL TRIAL

If the case goes to trial, you are the prosecuting attorney’s main witness. Be prepared!!!
DISPOSITION:

• This is a fancy way of saying how we end the case.

• Cases generally will not be disposed of until there is full compliance or a plan for compliance.
HOW DO WE END THE CASE?

Check your jurisdiction for available case dispositions!!!

In Connecticut, we can end the case with a:

• NOLLE
  – With conditions or without
• DIVERSIONARY PROGRAM
• CONVICTION
  – FINES
  – SUSPENDED SENTENCE
  – CONDITIONAL DISCHARGE
  – PROBATION
  – JAIL
FACTORS IN CREATING THE DISPOSITION

• Seriousness of the violations.
• Number of the violations.
• Cited person’s criminal and safety code violation history.
• Number of people present in the property put at risk.
• Time frame in which compliance has been reached.
SPECIAL CONDITIONS OF PROBATION OR DIVERSIONARY PROGRAM

• Must complete abatement and maintain.
• Must cooperate with code officials.
• All properties owned or managed must be code compliant in state.
• Attending appropriate classes depending on the types of violations.
• Community Service.
• Charitable Contribution.
REMEMBER...

• Code issues do not arise just between 9:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m., when everyone who could help you is in the office.

• You need to have a plan for when this circumstance happens, who to contact, their emergency numbers, what the chain of supervision shall be and who makes the final determination.

• **WHY?**

  **BECAUSE IT WILL HAPPEN!!!!!**
REFERRALS:

Everyone is busy, become familiar with and utilize the other agencies in your town to accomplish the goal.

- Building
- Fire
- Police
- Health
- Housing
- Planning and Zoning
- Animal control
- Legal
OTHER CONCERNS:

• Always be mindful of where you are.

• Various conditions/violations that you find may not be a result of purposeful disregard of the law. Determine the cause of non-compliance if possible before you choose your next enforcement step.

• There are mental health conditions that are a factor in some of the conditions you will find. For example, a deteriorated and collapsing house with excessive combustibles which may be a result of hoarding disorder, a mental health disorder.
UNLESS AUTHORIZED BY LAW, NEVER, NEVER, NEVER...

- Order any person to act without authority.
- Tell anyone you will have them arrested.
- Tell anyone you will get a search warrant.
- Tell anyone that you must be allowed on the property without legal grounds.
- Tell anyone what the prosecutor may or may not do with the case.
- Excuse anyone from a court date.
- Tell anyone that you will get their case dropped.
THANK YOU FOR ALL YOU DO FOR OUR SAFETY AND WELL-BEING
CONTACT INFORMATION:

Judith R. Dicine, J.D.
Supervisory Asst. State’s Atty., Housing Matters
State of CT, Division of Criminal Justice
Office of the Chief State’s Attorney
121 Elm Street
New Haven, CT 06510
Phone 203 773-6755
Fax 203 789-6459
Email: judith.dicine@ct.gov
Thank You For Attending